

QA Review — MC #9726 reviewing MC #9057

QA Review — MC #9726 (reviewing MC #9057)

Reviewer: John / pi-orchestrator (Proveo persona)

Reviewed at (UTC): 2026-07-28T21:31:57Z

Source task: #9057 — AI Factory Audit — Phase 0 Kickoff (Stop the Bleeding)

Source status: done

Source priority: H

Source owner: john

Review task: #9726 — QA review: #9057

Tool-verified source task state

`node ~/system/tools/mc.js show 9057` reports the source task as `done`, priority `H`, owner `john`, completed at `2026-04-27 16:55:14`.

Durable MC DoD/agent output for #9057 says:

- Phase 0 complete.
- `health-monitor` already fixed/killed on 2026-04-23 as a ghost script crash loop.
- B2 backup diagnosed as storage-cap exceeded; Alem action required.
- Critical daemons healthy.
- Evidence directory: `/Users/makinja/system/evidence/ai-factory-phase0-20260424-0635/`.

The same MC command reports `[alai/config] Mock mode active` from `/Users/makinja/system/tools/alai-config-mock.json`; this review is therefore against the local/mock MC record plus local disk evidence, not an independently live production control-plane record.

Source evidence files read

The following durable source artifacts were present on disk and read during review:

Artifact	Status	Notes
<code>/Users/makinja/system/specs/ai-factory-audit-plan.md</code>	present	Phase 0 plan defines T0.1-T0.5 acceptance items.
<code>/Users/makinja/system/evidence/ai-factory-phase0-20260424-0635/incident-1-health-monitor.md</code>	present	Records <code>com.alai.health-monitor</code> crash loop resolved and <code>.dead-2026-04-23</code> plist.
<code>/Users/makinja/system/evidence/ai-factory-phase0-20260424-0635/incident-2-b2-backup.md</code>	present	Records B2 failure as <code>403 storage_cap_exceeded</code> and explicitly blocks final backup restoration on Alem action.
<code>/Users/makinja/system/evidence/ai-factory-phase0-20260424-0635/daemons-sanity.md</code>	present	Records 2026-04-24 daemon sanity check and <code>/bin/bash /Users/makinja/system/tests/run-tests.sh</code> result <code>25/25 passed</code> .
<code>/Users/makinja/system/evidence/ai-factory-phase0-20260424-0635/alem-action-required.md</code>	present	Records required CEO action for Backblaze B2 cap.

Phase 0 acceptance review

Plan item	Evidence-backed review
T0.1 — kill <code>com.alai.health-monitor</code> crash loop	Supported by source evidence. <code>incident-1-health-monitor.md</code> says plist was unloaded/renamed <code>.dead-2026-04-23</code> ; current <code>launchctl list</code> also shows no <code>com.alai.health-monitor</code> entry and <code>com.john.health-monitor</code> exit <code>0</code> .
T0.2 — resolve B2 storage cap	Not complete as originally worded. Source task records diagnosis and Alem action required, not confirmed B2 restoration. Current <code>launchctl list</code>
T0.3 — fix exit-78 daemons wrong node path	Source evidence says no exit-78 daemons and no <code>/usr/local/bin/node</code> paths at the 2026-04-24 check. Current check found no <code>/usr/local/bin/node</code> in <code>~/Library/LaunchAgents/com.*.plist</code> , but did show current <code>com.drop.api</code> exit <code>78</code> , so this part cannot be blanket-approved as still clean today.
T0.4 — kill <code>com.alai.model-warmup</code> missing script	Source evidence does not contain a dedicated artifact for this item. No current verification command for <code>model-warmup</code> was run in this review.
T0.5 — fix critical-tools-healthcheck exit 3	Supported by source evidence and current probe: <code>launchctl list</code> shows <code>com.john.critical-tools-healthcheck</code> exit <code>0</code> .

QA-19 Gate Check

Ran `node ~/system/tools/qa-19.js check 9057`.

Result:

```
SCORE: 5/15 (4 skipped, 4 pending)
REQUIRED: 15/15 for H priority
GATE: PENDING
```

Key failing checks:

- `/tmp/gotcha-task-9057.md` not found.
- No GOTCHA evidence of tools/context.
- No build evidence / no hop-build marker.
- No test evidence in QA-19 format.
- `/tmp/verify-9057` not found or empty.
- No destination verification evidence.

Manual checks pending: error handling, output matches spec, self-review, CEO acceptance.

Additional verification run during this review

`/bin/bash /Users/makinja/system/tests/run-tests.sh` was executed and passed the current system test suite:

- Overall: `34/34 passed, 0 failed`.
- Included: boot, hivemind, manifest, mc, qa-19, spawn gate, GOTCHA gate, prompt injection guard, noise skip, sender trust scan, resolver filter, pi-orchestrator quality gate, verifier identity, and pi-orch collision tests.

This proves current system regression tests pass, but it does **not** by itself satisfy #9057's H-priority QA-19 gate because the historic task-specific GOTCHA/verify artifacts are absent.

Verdict

#9057 is partially supported but not independently approved under current H-priority QA standards.

Durable evidence supports the main Phase 0 operational story: the health-monitor crash loop was stopped, critical healthcheck was restored, and B2 was correctly diagnosed with a CEO action requirement. However, the original acceptance text for T0.2 said B2 write/backup success should be verified after cap resolution; the available #9057 evidence stops at diagnosis/blocker handoff. Current QA-19 remains `PENDING 5/15` and task-specific `/tmp` GOTCHA/verify artifacts are absent.

Operational interpretation:

- Treat #9057 as a valid historical incident triage/stop-the-bleeding record.
- Do not treat #9057 as full independent Proveo approval of all Phase 0 acceptance criteria.
- Preserve B2 restoration and current `com.drop.api` exit-78 as follow-up risks if they remain relevant to today's system state.

Required artifacts written by this review

- `/Users/makinja/system/evidence/9726/qa-review-9057.md`
- `/Users/makinja/system/evidence/9726/summary.json`
- `/Users/makinja/system/evidence/9726/verification.json`

BookStack

Published and verified via BookStack API:

- URL: <https://docs.alai.no/books/testing-qa/page/qa-review-mc-9726-reviewing-mc-9057>
- Page ID: 3306

Revision #2

Created 2026-07-28 21:35:02 UTC by John

Updated 2026-07-28 21:35:38 UTC by John