

QA Review — MC #9697

reviewing MC #8941

QA Review — MC #9697

(reviewing MC #8941)

Reviewer: John / pi-orchestrator (Proveo persona)

Reviewed at (UTC): 2026-07-28T21:27:40Z

Source task: #8941 — ACS Phase 1.3 — Python SDK alai-config-py (Pydantic v2)

Source status: done

Source priority: H

Source owner: codecraft

Review task: #9697 — QA review: #8941

Tool-verified source task state

```
node ~/system/tools/mc.js show 8941 reports:
```

- Status: `done`
- Priority: `H`
- Owner: `codecraft`
- DoD/agent output: `Python SDK alai-config-py built: 40/40 tests pass, wheel+sdist built, smoke test passes, AppConfig.load() typed model works. Proveo validation pending.`

`node ~/system/tools/mc.js show 9697` reports the QA review task was `blocked` because autowork had 5 failed attempts and needed human review.

The MC tool emitted `[alai/config] Mock mode active` from `/Users/makinja/system/tools/alai-config-mock.json`; this review is therefore anchored in the local/mock MC record plus direct file/test verification below.

Scope reviewed

Canonical package path reviewed:

- `/Users/makinja/business/ALAI-Holding-AS/internal/packages/alai-config-py`

Files read/reviewed:

- `pyproject.toml`
- `README.md`
- `Makefile`
- `src/alai_config/__init__.py`
- `src/alai_config/client.py`
- `src/alai_config/resolver.py`
- `src/alai_config/models/app_config.py`
- `src/alai_config/cache.py`
- `src/alai_config/mock.py`
- `src/alai_config/errors.py`
- `src/alai_config/aliases.py`
- `tests/conftest.py`
- `tests/test_cache.py`
- `tests/test_mock.py`
- `tests/test_resolver.py`

Lines reviewed by `wc -l`: 1,582 total across the files above.

Acceptance criteria check

Task 1.3 acceptance from `/Users/makinja/projects/alai-system/specs/alai-config-system-plan.md`:

Acceptance item	Review result	Evidence
Pydantic v2 AppConfig model generated from schema	PASS with implementation note	<code>pyproject.toml</code> requires <code>pydantic>=2.0</code> ; <code>src/alai_config/models/app_config.py</code> defines Pydantic v2 models and <code>AppConfig.load()</code> . <code>Makefile</code> codegen supports regeneration from <code>~/ALAI/internal/alai-config/schema/app-config.schema.json</code> ; current model file states it is manually authored when the schema file is unavailable.
Refuses to start on invalid schema	PASS	<code>AppConfig.load()</code> calls <code>cls.model_validate(raw)</code> and re-raises validation errors after logging. Smoke verified typed model load; tests cover invalid mock JSON and config init failures.

Acceptance item	Review result	Evidence
PyPI publish <code>alai-config</code>	NOT VERIFIED	Local build produced wheel and sdist. I found no current machine evidence that the package was published to PyPI or a private package index.

Commands executed and evidence

Check	Command	Result	Evidence file
Unit tests	<code>python3.12 -m pytest -q</code>	PASS — <code>40 passed</code>	<code>/Users/makinja/system/evidence/9697/pytest.log</code>
Package build	<code>python3.12 -m build</code>	PASS — built <code>alai-config-1.0.0.tar.gz</code> and <code>alai-config-1.0.0-py3-none-any.whl</code>	<code>/Users/makinja/system/evidence/9697/build.log</code>
Typed smoke	<code>ALAI_CONFIG MOCK_PATH=tests/fixtures/mock.json</code> <code>python3.12 ...</code> <code>AppConfig.load()</code>	PASS — initialized true, endpoint <code>http://localhost:3001</code> , VAT rate <code>0.20</code> is <code>Decimal</code> , LightRAG URL <code>http://localhost:9621</code>	<code>/Users/makinja/system/evidence/9697/smoke.log</code>
Syntax compile	<code>python3.12 -m compileall -q src tests</code>	PASS	<code>/Users/makinja/system/evidence/9697/static-checks.log</code>
Secret pattern scan	<code>grep -RinE ... src tests README.md pyproject.toml</code>	PASS — no matches in the static check log	<code>/Users/makinja/system/evidence/9697/static-checks.log</code>
QA-19 source gate	<code>node ~/system/tools/qa-19.js check 8941</code>	PENDING — score <code>5/15</code> ; historic <code>/tmp</code> GOTCHA/verify markers absent	<code>/Users/makinja/system/evidence/9697/qa19-8941.log</code>

Build artifact hashes:

- `dist/alai-config-1.0.0-py3-none-any.whl` — SHA-256 `69ec5e62fcbd0c87241161eae08e2cf9a362356f7ef38a9e44e1f1f9f4f885cb`
- `dist/alai-config-1.0.0.tar.gz` — SHA-256 `f9f46b830a6c2bbbc02a2cd262ae262ba6792ff64090135061a89fc3887cc9d6`

Findings

Blocking defects

None found in the reviewed source and test scope.

Should-fix / follow-up

1. Publish evidence missing for the `PyPI publish alai-config` acceptance item.

Local package build is verified, but no durable evidence was found for publish to PyPI or an internal package index. If publish was intentionally deferred, the acceptance item should be updated or a release task should be created.

2. QA-19 historic gate remains pending for #8941.

Current direct verification passes, but `qa-19.js check 8941` still fails because historic `/tmp/gotcha-task-8941.md`, `/tmp/verify-8941`, and hop-build marker files are absent. This review writes durable evidence under `/Users/makinja/system/evidence/9697/` to close the review task, but it does not mutate the historic source task gate state.

Optional hardening

- Add explicit tests for `AppConfig.load()` invalid typed values, for example invalid VAT decimal or invalid `Market` enum, to directly prove the fail-fast Pydantic path beyond mock-file parse errors.
- Add a release checklist documenting the exact package index target for proprietary `alai-config` publishing.

Code review verdict

Status: APPROVED_WITH_COMMENTS

Security: PASS

Tests: PASS — 40/40

Build: PASS — wheel and sdist produced

Source QA-19: PENDING due missing historic `/tmp` evidence markers

Overall: The Python SDK implementation is usable and verified locally for tests, build, syntax, and typed `AppConfig.load()` smoke. The only acceptance gap I could not verify is package publication.

BookStack

Published and verified via BookStack API:

- URL: <https://docs.alai.no/books/testing-qa/page/qa-review-mc-9697-reviewing-mc-8941>
- Page ID: 3304

Required artifacts written by this review

- `/Users/makinja/system/evidence/9697/qa-review-8941.md`
- `/Users/makinja/system/evidence/9697/summary.json`

- `/Users/makinja/system/evidence/9697/verification.json`
 - `/Users/makinja/system/evidence/9697/pytest.log`
 - `/Users/makinja/system/evidence/9697/build.log`
 - `/Users/makinja/system/evidence/9697/smoke.log`
 - `/Users/makinja/system/evidence/9697/static-checks.log`
 - `/Users/makinja/system/evidence/9697/qa19-8941.log`
-

Revision #2

Created 2026-07-28 21:31:35 UTC by John

Updated 2026-07-28 21:32:24 UTC by John