

QA Review — MC #9658

reviewing #9655

QA Review — MC #9658

reviewing source task #9655

Date: 2026-07-28 Reviewer: John / pi-orchestrator Scope: Auto-generated QA review for completed MC #9655, titled [TEST-QA-PROVE0-E] DEPLOY bypass test – force flag.

Completion criterion for MC #9658: deliver a tool-verified audit/report artifact for the source task. A failing or [NEEDS_WORK] verdict on source task #9655 is a valid QA review outcome; it does not mean this review artifact failed.

Source task facts verified with tools

```
node ~/system/tools/mc.js show 9655 verified:
```

- Source task: #9655
- Status: [done]
- Priority: [H]
- Owner: [proveo]
- Category: [system]
- DOD evidence: [QA test bypass]
- Agent output: [QA test bypass]

```
node ~/system/tools/mc.js history 9655 verified:
```

- Created by [john] at 2026-04-27 16:35:03.
- Started by [john] at 2026-04-27 16:36:36.
- Moved ready for review by [john] at 2026-04-27 16:36:44 with note [QA test bypass].
- Forced completion by [john] at 2026-04-27 16:36:48.
- The forced-completion record itself lists blocked/missing gates: QA-19 check required, GOTCHA file missing, hop-build not started, claim gate blocked because no trust labels, validator evidence missing, output contract missing, and PI2 deploy evidence missing.

QA-19 probe result

Command run:

```
node ~/system/tools/qa-19.js check 9655
```

Observed result in `/tmp/alai/9658-review/probe.txt`:

- Score: `5/15`.
- Gate: `PENDING`.
- Required for H priority: `15/15`.
- Failing checks included:
 - GOTCHA Written: `/tmp/gotcha-task-9655.md not found`.
 - Tools Checked: no evidence of tool check in GOTCHA.
 - Context Read: no context section in GOTCHA.
 - Build Passes: no build evidence and no hop-build marker.
 - Tests Pass: no test evidence.
 - Evidence Captured: `/tmp/verify-9655` not found or empty.
 - Destination Verified: no destination verification evidence.
- Manual checks still pending: Error Handling, Output Matches Spec, Self-Review, CEO Acceptance.

Artifact existence checks

The following required/evidence paths were checked and were absent:

```
MISSING /tmp/gotcha-task-9655.md
MISSING /tmp/verify-9655/validator-independent.json
MISSING /tmp/pi2-deploy-evidence-9655.json
```

Source-task QA verdict

Status for source MC #9655: `NEEDS_WORK / NOT APPROVED AS PRODUCTION-QUALITY COMPLETION`

Rationale:

- #9655 is a High-priority source task, but current QA-19 evidence is incomplete (`5/15`, gate `PENDING`).
- The only DOD/agent output is `QA test bypass`, which is not enough to prove build, test, deploy, validator, or destination verification.

- The source task history confirms it was closed through forced completion while multiple gates were missing.

Recommended follow-up

If #9655 was only an intentional bypass/force-flag harness test, no production remediation is required, but the test should be documented as such in the source task outcome. If it represented real deploy work, reopen or create a follow-up to supply the missing GOTCHA, build/test evidence, validator evidence, and PI2 deploy evidence before accepting the completion.

Evidence generated by this review

- Probe log: `/tmp/alai/9658-review/probe.txt`
- Review report: `/Users/makinja/system/evidence/9658/qa-review-9655.md`

Revision #2

Created 2026-07-28 10:47:04 UTC by John

Updated 2026-07-28 10:50:02 UTC by John